

Nos. 23-35329 and 23-35330

---

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

---

TRACY CAEKAERT and CAMILLIA MAPLEY  
*Plaintiffs-Appellees, and*

ARIANE ROWLAND and JAMIE SCHULZE  
*Plaintiffs-Appellees, v.*

PHILIP BRUMLEY,  
*Appellant, and*

WATCH TOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC.,  
*Defendants.*

On appeals from 28 U.S.C. § 1927 Sanction Orders against non-party District of  
Montana Nos. CV-20-52-BLG-SPW and CV-20-59-BLG-SPW  
The Honorable Susan P. Watters

---

**APPELLEES' SUPPLEMENTAL EXCERPTS OF RECORD**

---

Ryan R. Shaffer  
430 Ryman Street  
Missoula, MT 59802  
(406) 543-6929 | (406) 721-1799

*Attorney for Appellees* Tracy Caekaert, Camillia Mapley,  
Ariane Rowland, and Jamie Schulze

**INDEX TO SUPPLEMENTAL EXCERPTS OF RECORD**

<b>Tab</b>	<b>Docket No.</b>	<b>DOCUMENT</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Page</b>
		<b>VOLUME I</b>		
1	13 CV-20-52	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	6/22/2020	2
2	9 CV-20-59	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	6/22/2020	5
3	14 CV-20-52	Brief in Support of Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	6/22/2020	8
4	10 CV-20-59	Brief in Support of Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	6/22/2020	27
5	21 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	7/13/2020	46
6	15 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	7/13/2020	65
7	25 CV-20-52	Reply Brief in Support of Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	7/27/2020	84

8	18 CV-20-59	Reply Brief in Support of Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	7/27/2020	101
9	29 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion to Supplement Record re: Plaintiffs' Response to Defendant WTPA's Motion to Dismiss	8/5/2020	118
10	20 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion to Supplement Record re: Plaintiffs' Response to Defendant WTPA's Motion to Dismiss	8/5/2020	122
11	31 CV-20-52	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Supplement the Record (Doc. 28)	8/14/2020	125
12	23 CV-20-59	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Supplement the Record (Doc. 28)	8/14/2020	133
13	32 CV-20-52	Order Providing for Jurisdictional Discovery	8/18/2020	141
14	24 CV-20-59	Order Providing for Jurisdictional Discovery	8/18/2020	149
15	56 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel Jurisdictional Discovery Responses and for Costs and Fees	4/20/2021	156
16	46 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel Jurisdictional Discovery Responses and for Costs and Fees	4/20/2021	158
17	57 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion to Compel Jurisdictional Discovery Responses and for Costs and Fees	4/20/2021	160

18	47 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion to Compel Jurisdictional Discovery Responses and for Costs and Fees	4/20/2021	188
19	58 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel re: the Hardin Congregation Subpoena	4/21/2021	216
20	48 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel re: the Hardin Congregation Subpoena	4/21/2021	218
21	59 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion to Compel re: Hardin Congregation Subpoena	4/21/2021	220
22	49 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion to Compel re: Hardin Congregation Subpoena	4/21/2021	229
23	82 CV-20-52	Order re Motion to Compel Hardin Congregation's Subpoena	7/30/2021	238
24	77 CV-20-59	Order re Motion to Compel Hardin Congregation's Subpoena	9/20/2021	245
25	85 CV-20-52	Order re Motion to Compel Jurisdictional Discovery Responses and for Costs and Fees	8/24/2021	255
<b>VOLUME II</b>				
26	72 CV-20-59	Order re Motion to Compel Jurisdictional Discovery Responses and for Costs and Fees	8/24/2021	274
27	96 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	11/5/2021	292
28	96-1 CV-20-52	Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P and Tabs 1-5 of Appendix	11/5/2021	327

		<b>VOLUME III</b>		
29	96-1 CV-20-52	Tabs 6-8 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	369
		<b>VOLUME IV</b>		
30	96-1 CV-20-52	Tabs 9-15 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	621
		<b>VOLUME V</b>		
31	96-1 CV-20-52	Tabs 16-21 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	897
		<b>VOLUME VI</b>		
32	96-1 CV-20-52	Tabs 22-31 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	1090
		<b>VOLUME VII</b>		
33	96-1 CV-20-52	Tabs 31A-40 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	1295

34	86 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P.	11/5/2021	1538
35	86-1 CV-20-59	Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P and Tab 1	11/5/2021	1573
		<b>VOLUME VIII</b>		
36	86-1 CV-20-59	Tabs 2-8 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	1581
		<b>VOLUME IX</b>		
37	86-1 CV-20-59	Tabs 9-15 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	1867
		<b>VOLUME X</b>		
38	86-1 CV-20-59	Tabs 16-21 Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	2143
		<b>VOLUME XI</b>		
39	86-1 CV-20-59	Tabs 22-31 - Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	2336

<b>VOLUME XII</b>				
40	86-1 CV-20-59	Tabs 31A-40 - Appendix to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2), Fed. R. Civ. P	11/5/2021	2541
41	101 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2783
42	90 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2786
43	102 CV-20-52	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2789
44	102-1 CV-20-52	Affirmation of Joel M. Taylor – Filed in Support of Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2803
45	102-2 CV-20-52	Excerpt from Deposition of James Rowland - Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2806
<b>VOLUME XIII</b>				
46	102-4 CV-20-52	DV-16-084 – Order Enforcing May 26, 2021, Order, Assessing Sanctions and Attorney's Fees and D070723 – California Court of Appeals Opinion Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2815
47	91 CV-20-59	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2864
48	91-1 CV-20-59	Affirmation of Joel M. Taylor – Filed in Support of Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2878
49	91-2 CV-20-59	Excerpt from Deposition of James Rowland - Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2881

50	91-4 CV-20-59	DV-16-084 – Order Enforcing May 26, 2021, Order, Assessing Sanctions and Attorney’s Fees and D070723 – California Court of Appeals Opinion Plaintiffs’ Brief in Support of Their Motion for Sanctions	12/3/2021	2889
51	106 CV-20-52	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania’s Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs’ Motion for Sanctions	12/28/2021	2938
52	95 CV-20-59	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania’s Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs’ Motion for Sanctions	12/28/2021	2968
53	107 CV-20-52	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania’s Unopposed Motion for Oral Argument on Plaintiffs’ Motion for Sanctions	1/3/2022	2997
54	96 CV-20-59	Defendant Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society of Pennsylvania’s Unopposed Motion for Oral Argument on Plaintiffs’ Motion for Sanctions	1/3/2022	3000